



## Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact [support@jstor.org](mailto:support@jstor.org).

the learned for the two periods in question. Again the two things of interest for us, and the only matters which concern us here, are that the movement was from below upward, and that at *some* point in the development the pronunciation of the common man differed from that of his better-trained contemporary.

FRANK FROST ABBOTT

---

CAESAR BELL. GALL. VI. 30. 4, AGAIN

In the October number of *Classical Philology*, pp. 465, 466, Professor Knapp takes exception to my proposed emendation of Caesar *Bell. Gall.* vi. 30. 4 (*Classical Philology* I, 290, 291). It is not my intention to prolong the discussion, for an extended argument upon a question of textual emendation is valueless, since nothing can be proved absolutely. The decision is always more or less a personal one, resting upon a feeling that the individual critic has for the author's style and mode of expression, and this feeling results from an extensive and sympathetic reading of the author's works. I wish here merely to reiterate the fact that I was not attempting to emend a sound passage. I am as averse as Professor Knapp is to change a reading that is supported by all the manuscript authority. I was proposing, however, what seemed to me, and still seems to me, to be a correction of a corrupt passage. I shall not give again the reasons for my belief, but as I come back to this passage from year to year, the sentence as I emended it (*mortem* for *multum*) appeals to me at least as one which accords more with Caesarian usage.

Professor Knapp thinks that *mortem* could not easily be mistaken for *multum*. But why could it not? The words are quite similar in their general appearance. Surely my critic does not expect to lay down mathematical formulas to account for the curious workings of the human mind. The explanation of errors in copying must often be a psychological one which cannot be reduced to rule. How often have we all had the experience of miswriting a word where the error afterward seemed absurd and could be explained only by preoccupation of mind! I have nothing to add to my previous statement, but I did not wish, by my silence, to convey the impression that Professor Knapp's argumentation was to me convincing.

WALTER DENNISON

---

TRANSPOSITION VARIANTS IN CICERO'S *PRO CLUENTIO*

[The sigla are as in A. C. Clark's text, in the Oxford Classical Series. The reading first cited is the one which seems most deserving of being adopted in the text.]

§9 *caput illius* codd. praeter ΣST (*illius caput*). This inversion, derived from the *Cluniacensis*, may have been caused by the omission and reinsertion of *illius*, which seems to come most naturally here *after* the word *caput*.

§13 *se sine scelere*  $\Sigma$ ST and Arusianus; *sine scelere se*  $M_{\mu}$ . It may be noted here that in the *Codex Balliolensis* (see my edition, Introd. p. xliii) the words *sine scelere* are actually supplied in the margin.

§17 *cuiuscumque modi*  $\Sigma b^2 \Psi^2$ ST; *cuiusmodicumque*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§19 *vos volui* codd. (including the Turin Palimpsest) *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*volui vos*).

§21 *in ergastulo fuit* P; *fuit in ergastulo* rell. Here Clark regards the reading of the Palimpsest, against Zielinski; cf. also the Scholiast on Lucan ii. 95. *heredem fecit* P $\Sigma$ ST; *fecit heredem*  $M_{\mu}$ . *est mortuus* codd. *praeter*  $\Sigma b$ ST (*mortuus est*). *sororis suae filium* codd. *praeter* ST (*sororis filium suae*—according to Baiter, but not noted by Clark).

§22 *reciperandi filii* P $\Sigma$ ST; *filii reciperandi*  $M_{\mu}$ . *est mortua* codd. *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*mortua est*).

§25 *autem fugam*  $\Sigma$ ST; *fugam autem*  $M_{\mu}$ . *tres praeterea* ST; *alios praeterea tres* (om. *praeterea b'*)  $M_{\mu}$ . Here *alios* may = *al.* the sign of a marginal variant; cf. §171, and *In Verrem* iii, §138.

§27 *ille tres*  $\Sigma$ ST; *tres ille*  $M_{\mu}$ . *misera nihil mali*  $\Sigma$ ST; *nihil mali misera*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§28 *solent esse* codd. *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*esse solent*). Here Müller, Clark, and Zielinski prefer *solent esse*.

§33 *adhibitis amicis* P (Müller, Zielinski); *amicis adhibitis*  $M_{\mu}$ ST (Clark).

§36 *recenti re fuit* P; *fuit recenti*  $\Sigma b^2 \Psi^2$ ST; *recenti re* (om. *re b' \Psi'*)  $M_{\mu}$ .

§40 *curari velle*  $\Sigma b^2 \Psi^2$ ST; *velle curari* rell. (and so Müller, Clark—perhaps rightly). *omnes suos*  $\Sigma b^2 \Psi^2$ ST; *suos omnes*  $M_{\mu}$ . Here Müller (and so too Zielinski) follows the vulgate; Clark reads *omnis suos* (*sua omnia*, *Amic.* §30).

§41 *similem sui eum*  $\Sigma$ ST; *eum similem sui* (om. *sui b \sigma*)  $M_{\mu}$ . *nemo iam*  $\Sigma$ ST; *iam nemo*  $M_{\mu}$ ; *nemo* Quint. ix. 3. 38.

§42 *suo salvo capite*  $\Sigma$ ST (cf. Zielinski, p. 199); *salvo capite suo*  $M_{\mu}$  (“sehr schlecht”).

§46 *est usus*  $\Sigma$ ST; *usus est*  $M_{\mu}$ . *esse turpem*  $\Sigma$ ST; *turpem esse*  $M_{\mu}$ .

Cf. §50 *ne illi quidem ipsi*  $M_{\mu}$  (Müller); *ne illi ipsi quidem*  $\Sigma$ ST (Clark).

§51 *non id*  $\Sigma$ BST; *id non*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§53 *insidias factas*  $\Sigma$ ST; *factas insidias*  $M_{\mu}$ FW. *alia de re*  $\Sigma$ ST; *de alia re*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§60 *bis iam condemnatus*  $\Sigma$ ST; *iam bis condemn.* b; *bis condemn.* iam  $M_{\sigma} \Psi$ .

§62 *causam esse potuisse* codd. *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*esse causam potuisse*).

§63 *esse corruptum* codd. (and Quint. ix. 2. 51) *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*corruptum esse*).

§64 *esse iudicium* codd. (and Quint.) *praeter*  $\Sigma$ ST (*iudicium esse*).

§65 *Oppianice, appello* ΣST; *appello Oppianice* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§68 *suis eum* ΣST; *eum suis* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§70 *mentem suam* codd. praeter Σb<sup>2</sup>Ψ<sup>2</sup>ST (*suam mentem*). Zielinski (p. 199) rejects this latter reading. *ipsi igitur* ΣST; *igitur ipsi* M<sub>μ</sub>. (Cf. §96; Milo §43.) *non fieri* ΣST; *fieri non* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§77 *nulla esse iudicia* codd. (including the Palimpsest) praeter ST (*nulla iudicia esse*).

§79 *iniectum esse* codd. praeter ΣST (*esse iniectum*).

§80 *tempore potius* ΣST; *potius tempore* M<sub>μ</sub>. Cf. §174. §80 *temptatum esse iudicium* ΣST; *iudicium temptatum esse* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§81 *Dicil accusator* ΣST; *accusator dicil* M<sub>μ</sub>. *criminum et atrocitatem* ΣST; *et atroc. criminum* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§88 *ista multa* ΣbST; *multa ista* M<sub>σ</sub>Ψ.

§92 *idem illud* P<sub>σ</sub>ST; *illud idem* MbΨ. *inquit idcirco* PΣST; *idcirco inquit* M<sub>μ</sub>. *fuit C. Iunio* P; *Iunio fuit* M<sub>μ</sub>ST.

Cf. §95 *clarissimi viri atque amplissimi* ΣST; *clar. atque ampl. viri* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§96 *illud igitur* ΣST; *igitur illud* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§101 *omnes eius* codd. praeter ST (*eius omnes*).

§108 *totam causam* ΣST; *causam totam* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§110 *desuefactam iam* ΣST; *iam desuefactam* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§111 *mores et arrogantiam eius* ΣST; *mores eius et* (om. et bΨ) *arrog.* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§112 *est absolutus* codd. praeter S (*absolutus est*).

§113 *non obiecta* ΣST; *obiecta non* rell.

§119 *illud primum* ΣST; *primum illud* M<sub>μ</sub>. *illud unum* codd. praeter S (*illud unum*). *esse ipsum postea* ΣST; *ipsum postea esse* M<sub>μ</sub>. *erant a censoribus* ΣST; *a censoribus erant* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§121 *numquam sibi* codd. praeter ST (*sibi numquam*).

§124 *bonum virum* ΣST; *virum bonum* M<sub>μ</sub>. *coniunctum cum re* esse S; *coniunctum esse cum re* T; *cum re coniunctum esse* M<sub>μ</sub>. Here Müller (and Zielinski) follows S; Clark adopts the vulgate.

§125 *deprehensus sit* ΣST; *sit deprehensus* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§126 *aliquo gravi* ΣST; *gravi aliquo* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§130 *erat illud* P; *illud erat* rell.

§134 *vellet dicere* ΣST; *dicere vellet* M<sub>μ</sub>. *nemo contra* ΣST; *contra nemo* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§136 *id senatus* ΣST; *senatus id* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§138 *sua natura* codd. (and Rufinianus) praeter ΣST. *iudicium fuisse* ΣST; *fuisse iudicium* M<sub>μ</sub>.

§139 *nostra auctoritate* μ (Müller, Zielinski); *auctoritate nostra* MST (Clark).

§142 *opinioe populari* codd. (and so Clark) praeter Σb<sup>2</sup>Ψ<sup>2</sup>ST (*populari opinione*; but so Müller, Zielinski).

§143 *imprudentes videlicet*  $\Sigma$ S and Quintilian (v. 13. 47); *videlicet imprudentes*  $M_{\mu}$ ; *imprudentes* om. T. *hoc tibi*  $\Sigma$ ST and Quintil.; *tibi hoc*  $M_{\mu}$ . *legis fecerim*  $\Sigma$ ST; *fecerim legis*  $M_{\mu}$  (but so Müller, Zielinski).

§148 T. *Acci te*  $\Sigma$ ST; *te T. Acci*  $M_{\mu}$ . *ipsa tamen lex nos*  $\Sigma$ ST; *tamen ipsa lex* (add. nos b<sup>2</sup>)  $M_{\mu}$ .

§154 *ne ea*  $\Sigma$ ST; *ea ne*  $b\chi\Psi$ .

§156 *causam dicit eques Romanus*  $\Sigma$ ST; *eques Rom. causam dicit* rell.

§157 *vitae meae* ST (Müller, Zielinski); *meae vitae* rell. (Clark). *incertum et infinitum*  $\Sigma$ ST; *infinitum et incertum*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§160 *figenda esse sibi* ST and ( $\Sigma$ ?) i. e. erasure in  $\Sigma$ ; *sibi figenda esse*  $M_{\mu}$ . *me necessario*  $\Sigma$ ST (Clark); *necessario me*  $M_{\mu}$ . (Müller, Zielinski).

§162 *cautum satis*  $\Sigma$ ST; *satis cautum*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§164 *esse reum volunt*  $\Sigma$ ST; *reum* (re niti b<sup>2</sup> $\Psi^2$ ) *volunt esse*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§171 *Habitus vitae*  $\Sigma$ ST; *vitae Habitus*  $M_{\mu}$ . *aliud* (om. aliud b) *mors eripuit*  $M_{\mu}$ ; *mors eripuit aliud* S; *eripuit mors* T. al?

§172 *per quem venenum*  $\Sigma$ ST; *venenum per quem*  $M_{\mu}$ . *scelus suum*  $\Sigma$ bST; *suum scelus*  $M_{\sigma\Psi}$ .

§174 *potius ad alios*  $\Sigma$ ST; *ad alios potius*  $M_{\mu}$ . Cf. §80.

§175 *domino renuntiare*  $\Sigma$ ST; *renuntiare domino*  $M_{\mu}$ . *improb-  
tatem coloni in Falerno*  $\Sigma$ ST; *in Fal. improb. col.*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§176 *moliri statim*  $\Sigma$ ST; *statim moliri*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§183 *igitur alia*  $\Sigma\Psi^2$ ST; *alia igitur* rell. *vobis dicendum*  $\Sigma$ ST; *dicendum vobis*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§184 *nulla littera*  $\Sigma$ b<sup>2</sup> $\Psi^2$ ST; *littera nulla*  $M_{\mu}$ . *dictum adiungere*  $\Sigma$ ST; *adiungere dictum*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§189 *a viro improbo*  $\Sigma$ ST; *ab improbo viro*  $M_{\mu}$ .

§191 *misisset, ipsa*  $\Sigma\Psi^2$ ST; *ipsa misisset* rell. (wrongly).

§197 *homines honestissimos* codd. praeter  $b\Psi$  (*honestissimos homines*).

§202 *animum non*  $b\chi\Psi$  (Clark); *animum*  $\Sigma$ A  $B\pi\phi$ ; *non animum* ST (Müller).

W. PETERSON

McGILL UNIVERSITY  
Montreal